



Brighton City Council Meeting

City Hall Council Chambers • 200 N First St. • Brighton, Michigan 48116
(810) 227-1911 • www.brightoncity.org

MINUTES OF THE REGULAR MEETING OF THE BRIGHTON CITY COUNCIL HELD ON JUNE 6, 2019

1. Call to Order

Mayor Muzzin called the Regular Meeting to order at 7:30 p.m.

2. Pledge of Allegiance

3. Roll Call

Present were Mayor Muzzin, Councilmembers: Bohn, Emaus, Gardner, Pettengill, Pipoly, and Tobbe. Staff: City Manager Nate Geinzer, City Clerk Tara Brown, Finance Director Gretchen Gomolka, DPW Director Marcel Goch, Assistant to the DPW Director Patty Thomas, Human Resource Manager Michelle Miller, Chief Rob Bradford, and Attorney Paul Burns. There were approximately thirty persons in the audience.

4. Consider Approval of the Agenda

Motion by Councilmember Emaus, seconded by Mayor Pro Tem Pipoly to approve the agenda as presented. **The motion carried without objection.**

Consent Agenda Items

Motion by Councilmember Gardner, seconded by Councilmember Pettengill to approve the consent agenda as presented. **The motion carried without objection by roll call vote.**

5. Approval of Minutes: Study Session Meeting of May 16, 2019

6. Approval of Minutes: Regular Meeting of May 16, 2019

7. Approval of Resolution # 19-15 Dissolving the Local Development Finance Authority (LDFA)

8. Approval of Resolution #19-16 Establishing Proposed Additional Millage Rate as Approved by Voters May 7, 2019

9. Approval of Tridge Railing and Light Bollard Painting to MPM Painting in the Amount of \$14,015

10. Approval of Revocable License Agreement with BMH Realty and Ginopolis Restaurant for Use of Adjacent Right-of Way

11. Approval of Traffic Control Orders #168 - 171 as Recommended

12. Approval of Mayor's Recommended Reappointments to DDA Board and Planning Commission

Correspondence

13. Eagle Scout Proclamations: Aaron Lee, Ayden Mooney, and Michael Nassoii

Mayor Muzzin presented the Eagle Scouts with proclamations. Each Eagle Scout spoke briefly about their project.

14. Proclamation Recognizing June as Alzheimer's & Brain Awareness Month

Mayor Muzzin and Council proclaimed June as Alzheimer's and Brain Awareness month. A representative from the Brighton Alzheimer's chapter thanked City Council for this honor and continued support of the Alzheimer's Association.

15. Call to the Public

Mayor Muzzin opened the Call to Public at 7:47 p.m.

Mark Binkley spoke about the proposed civic event fee structure.

Dennis Demoff spoke about the history of the Kiwanis Concerts. He is opposed to the fee.

Mary Zucchero from the Livingston County Visitors Bureau also spoke in opposition of the civic event fee agenda item.

Makayla Duke, Swinginfusion, spoke in opposition to the proposed civic event fee structure.

Sophia Freni, Director of Events at the Greater Brighton Area Chamber of Commerce, read a prepared speech in opposition of the proposed civic event fees.

Pam McConeghy continued Sophia Freni's prepared speech adding that she is also opposed to the civic event fees.

Jamie Dietrich resident, realtor, and daughter of 2 Stones Events stated that she is opposed to civic events noting that it will impact her home and livelihood.

Thaddeus McGaffey spoke in opposition of the civic event fees.

Joey Stinson, new business owner, spoke briefly in opposition of the proposed civic event fee structure.

Keith Karp spoke against the civic event fee agenda item.

Melissa Ginopolis introduced herself and new general manager Heather Smith for the new restaurant Ginopolis at 201 Main Street, opening end of July. She spoke in solidarity with the other merchants and event organizers.

David and Milo Leisk, new business owner of Culture Beer and Cheese, spoke in opposition to the proposed civic event fees.

Mayor Muzzin closed the Call to Public at 8:27 p.m.

16. Staff Updates

Director Goch updated that Single Barrel Social will be paving the section of Grand River that was disturbed during the week of June 10th, 2019.

17. Updates from Councilmember Liaisons to Various Boards and Commissions

Councilmember Bohn stated that during the May 20, 2019 Planning Commission meeting the commission extended the preliminary PUD for Brighton Village for ninety days and require the developer to have a final site plan presented to the Planning Commission by the deadline. The commission also approved Site Plan #19-09 for Uptown on First, which is eight three story townhouse style condos.

Councilmember Emaus thanked all who attended and worked to make the Memorial Day parade a success.

Public Hearing

18. Conduct a Public Hearing Regarding Proposed Additional Millage Rate as Approved by Voters May 7, 2019

Director Gomolka introduced the item asking that Mayor Muzzin make clear that action will immediately follow the public hearing per the published notice.

Mayor Muzzin stated that action will follow the public hearing and opened the public hearing at 8:31 p.m. Hearing and seeing no comment, Mayor Muzzin closed the public hearing at 8:32 p.m.

New Business

19. Consider Adoption of Resolution #19-17 Setting Fiscal Year 2019/2020 Millage Rates

Director Gomolka introduced the agenda item explaining the millage structure. Ms. Gomolka noted that for the first time in thirteen years there will be a Headlee rollback and how it applies to the current millage rate and for how long. Councilmember Gardner asked if the millage rate will be subject to the rollback, Ms. Gomolka indicated that it will be subject to rollback.

Motion by Councilmember Bohn, seconded by Councilmember Tobbe to adopt Resolution #19-17 Setting Fiscal Year 2019/2020 Millage Rates. **The motion carried without objection by roll call vote.**

20. Consider Approval of Civic/Special Event Policy, Application, and Fees

Mayor Muzzin introduced the agenda item. Councilmember Bohn noted that the civic events agenda item has been before council three or four times and is not something new brought to City Council. Mr. Bohn spoke about the current funding shortage and listed several areas of concern within the city before the city funds events. He stated the extensive roadwork that is needed throughout the city as well as OPEB and unfunded pension liabilities. He stated that something must be done and asked, in response to a Call to Public comment, what about other businesses along Grand River who do not benefit financially from civic events on Main Street. Mr. Bohn outlined the Task Force three-pronged approach for cuts throughout the city. He further mentioned that a minimal admission fee could be an option for civic events. Councilmember Pettengill asked how Mr. Bohn envisions charging and collecting admission. Mr. Bohn responded that throughout his travels, he has been to several events where barricading has worked with entrances stationed with employees to accept the fee.

Councilmember Pettengill stated that events are extremely important to the survival to the city and provide vibrancy to the community feel. She understands that not everyone has chosen Brighton as home because of the civic events but her family has. She further stated that the events do not get rich from the events but gain funds to provide for the next year. She cautions that implementing a civic event fee could be detrimental to the community and does not support any reimbursement fee that could cripple the events.

Councilmember Tobbe understands the budgetary concerns of the city and is not in favor of 100% reimbursement. He noted that even fifty percent is too high and could drive out some events. He recommends a ten percent reimbursement coupled with a small Task Force comprised of Councilmembers, event organizers, and city staff to find a way together to fund the events. He cautions that a rainout could sink an event.

Mayor Pro Tem Pipoly is concerned because only a small sample of residents are being heard and as a Councilmember he must speak for all residents and business owners. He does not believe events should go away because of fees, as a business owner he must adapt to new fees and costs. He supports no more than fifty percent.

Councilmember Gardner spoke about the Task Force findings and maintains that the three pronged approach is important and must be followed. Ms. Gardner stated that employees are being asked for big concessions and city residents were asked for a new millage proposal. Ms. Gardner is very sympathetic to both the city's position and the event organizers. She supports fifty percent, but not one hundred percent.

Councilmember Emaus stated that he loves the culture, residents, events, but the living and breathing fiscal pressures of the city are very real. There are several cuts that have been made including those made to the senior center, Imagination Center, department resources, and much more. He stated he has advocated for one hundred percent but is willing to come down to fifty percent. He would like to see if it is possible to put snow fencing up and charge admission noting several other communities that have fees or reimbursement in place. He would also volunteer to be on a Task Force to help investigate revenue sources. Mr. Emaus would like the three parades, Memorial Day, Fourth of July, Veteran's Day, be exempt from fees and classified as city events.

Mayor Muzzin stressed that the proposed reimbursement is not an income stream, but are actual costs. He further states that he loves the civic events and volunteers at several. He would support fifty percent. He also commented that he has heard that some feel that 501c3 should be exempt, but there are twenty-seven classifications under 501c3. Mr. Muzzin spoke about several large 501c3's like Blue Cross Blue Shield that do have money. The mission is what sets a not for profit 501c3 aside, rather than how much money they have.

Councilmember Pettengill asks how it is not discrimination to exempt the parades. Mr. Emaus explained his reasoning as those events are city focused/city only event. Ms. Pettengill also asked about the Holiday Glow event and spoke about the fees associated with the event. Council discussed categories within the fee structure. Mr. Emaus read from the provided spreadsheet with costs associated with each event and further stated that the total cost for the Holiday Glow but is concerned with allowing outside influence in consideration for donations. Ms. Pettengill also asked about the previously approved AMP costs and asked how it will be considered in the fifty percent reduction. Mr. Emaus stated that the events will choose what services they need whether it is The AMP or road closures. Mr. Bohn read from the approved AMP fees as approved at a prior council meeting. Manager Geinzer stated that staff will construct the fees as directed by council.

Motion by Councilmember Tobbe, seconded by Councilmember Pettengill to institute for the 2020 year a ten percent cost share and form a task force with Councilmembers, staff, event organizers, and business owners to look at what scaling up to fifty percent over four years and bring back a recommendation to City Council by the end of September. **The motion failed. Roll call vote: Bohn-no, Emaus-no, Gardner-no, Muzzin-no, Pettengill-yes, Pipoly-no, and Tobbe-yes.**

Motion by Mayor Pro Tem Pipoly, seconded by Councilmember Emaus to approve fifty percent reimbursement over three years with the first year reimbursement being one third and ramp up to fifty percent and a full review after three years. The AMP rental will be included with civic event policy. **The motion carried by roll call vote. Roll call vote: Bohn-no, Emaus-yes, Gardner-yes, Muzzin-no, Pettengill-yes, Pipoly-yes, and Tobbe-no.**

Other Business

21. Call to the Public

Mayor Muzzin opened the Call to Public at 9:28 p.m.

Pam McConeghy thanked City Council for the tough discussion and appreciated the percentages.

Thaddeus McGaffey stated is displeasure with the motion.

Keith Karp would like to see a spreadsheet of actual costs. He questions the garbage bags cost and notes he can buy garbage bags at Home Depot.

Barb Binkley is opposed to the fee and views the events as an opportunity to support businesses.

Dennis Demoff stated that the Kiwanis Club has never made a profit and is disappointed in the motion approved by City Council.

Sophia Freni offered a personal story to reflect upon.

Mayor Muzzin closed the Call to Public at 9:40 p.m.

22. Adjournment

Motion by Councilmember Tobbe, seconded by Councilmember Emaus to adjourn the meeting at 9:40 p.m. **The motion carried without objection.**

Tara Brown, City Clerk

James Muzzin, Mayor